EPA/NEWMOA Mercury Science & Policy Conference

MERCURY PRODUCT POLICIES: AN INDUSTRY PERSPECTIVE

MARK A. KOHORST
NATIONAL ELECTRICAL MANUFACTURERS ASSOCIATION
November 2009

My Plan

- Provide Overview of NEMA - Organization, Functions, and Products
- Discuss Mercury Product Policies
  - What do we Support?
  - What do we Oppose?
- Address Specific Product Issues
  - Lamps
  - Thermostats
  - Batteries
NEMA Vital Statistics

- Created 1926, Principal Trade Association Representing US Electro-Product Industry
- Membership: Appr 450 US Manufacturers
  - Products used in Generation, Transmission, Distribution, and End-Use of Electricity
  - 8 Industry Divisions, ~50 Product Sections
  - Dry Batteries to Motors to Traffic Signaling Equip to MRIs, etc.
- Principally a Standards Organization
  - More than 500 Industry Standards; Internally and With ANSI and IEC
- Also Advocacy, Market Data Collection & Analysis, Safety Promotion, International Collaboration

Electro-Industry Products

- NEMA products constitute the *foundation* of the worldwide electrical infrastructure
- Most NEMA Products are Industrial/Commercial
  - Long-lived
  - Large, stationary
  - Embedded in infrastructure
  - Little chance of potential harmful exposures
- Certain high value, common consumer products have long relied on Hg for functionality & efficiency
  - Hg switch thermostats
  - EE lamps
  - Consumer batteries
Mercury Product Policies - Overview

Key Principles

- Ideal policies adequately reflect . . .
  - Characteristics of the product
  - Characteristics of the market
  - Realities of science, technology, and economics
  - Careful consideration of associated costs and benefits
- Ideal approach can differ by product type, market conditions, etc.
  (What's best for thermostats may not work for lamps, batteries, etc.)
- If collection and recycling are deemed to be the best option, NEMA favors true Product Stewardship approach.

Product Stewardship Defined

According to US EPA . . .

"Product stewardship is a product-centered approach to environmental protection. It calls on those in the product lifecycle—manufacturers, retailers, users, and disposers—to share responsibility for reducing the environmental impacts of products."
(http://www.epa.gov/epawaste/partnerships/stewardship/index.htm)

Furthermore . . .

"Product stewardship recognizes that product manufacturers must take on new responsibilities to reduce the environmental footprint of their products. However, real change cannot always be achieved by producers acting alone: retailers, consumers, and the existing waste management infrastructure need to help to provide the most workable and cost-effective solutions. Solutions and roles will vary from one product system to another."
Product Stewardship Contd

- Primary Goal of Product Stewardship?
  - Reduce adverse impacts of products on the environment and public health. Focus on entire product cycle; design through end-of-life.
- NEMA’s View
  - Ideal approach is one that best serves that goal in the most efficient and effective way

** Key is to Recognize and Make Use of **

Strengths/Advantages of Various Stakeholders

- Manufacturers’ clearest strength is designing new and better products; and provide information to the market

“Extended Producer Responsibility”

- EPR = Prescriptive form of Product Stewardship
  - "One Size Fits All"
  - *e.g.*, AB 283 in Calif, HB 3060 in OR
- Places Entire Legal, Cost, & Performance Burden on Manufacturers
  - Claims of “Flexibility” & “Shared Responsibility” are Illusory
  - Reflects Ideology
- Based on False Presumptions
  - Provides Incentives to Develop “Greener” Products
  - Producers can Exercise “Power” in the Marketplace
- Ignores Critical Differences in Products, Markets, Consumption/Use Patterns, etc.
**NEMA Preferred Approach**

- **Shared Responsibility**
  - All stakeholders should be engaged. Don’t assign financial & administrative responsibility, enforcement, to one group by fiat.

- **Rational and Attainable Program Goals**
  - Need credible data
  - Parties responsible for actions/functions they can control!

- **Cost Efficient/Economically Viable**
  - Minimize expense, particularly to consumers

- **Accessible**
  - Key factor for collection programs

- **Environmental Benefits Commensurate with Costs**
  - If benefits < costs, what’s the point?

---

**Product Area - Thermostats**

**In a Nutshell . . .**

- NEMA supports state legislation that complements the efforts and reflects the experience of the TRC
- NEMA opposes state legislation that adds costs with no benefits to the TRC operations

**Thermostat Recycling Corporation**

- Only national thermostat recycling program in US
- Formed by Honeywell, GE, White-Rodgers in 1998; now has 29 paying corporate members
- Operates in 48 states, accepts all t-stats regardless of brand
- Except for $25 bin fee, manufacturers absorb all costs
- Over 4 tons of mercury collected
Product Area - Thermostats Contd

**NEMA therefore supports . . .**
- Inclusion of all current and former manufacturers of mercury thermostats (i.e., “Producer” = brand owner)
- Mandatory contractor recycling
- Mandatory wholesaler participation
- Shared education and outreach
- Explicit authority for the program to manage risk
- A sunset provision
- Incorporating compliance activities into licensing programs (where possible)

**NEMA opposes . . .**
- Mandatory financial incentives
- Mandatory mail-back programs
- Performance goals tied to collection rates, based on *ad hoc* models that have not been field tested
- Public review and comment on manufacturer plans
- Requirement on manufacturers to “maximize” collection of thermostats

Product Area - Lamps

**In a Nutshell . . .**
- NEMA supports lamp recycling legislation that promotes widespread education on proper lamp disposal, creates a shared responsibility framework to maximize the number of mercury lamps collected and recycled from households, and minimizes the impact on the market price of energy efficient lamps.

- “Cost internalization” is economically untenable for lamps
  - Cost of collection, transport, recycling nearly = purchase price of a lamp. No model for this.
  - Creates upward pressure on price of EE lighting. Not a good outcome in era of energy efficiency
  - Forces manufacturers into recycling business - opposed by recyclers
Product Area - Lamps Contd

NEMA therefore supports . . .

- Disposal bans for businesses, with recycling through existing private infrastructure
- Household recycling funded through broad-based structure (e.g., Waste fees? Visible fee?)
- Mandatory mfr participation
- Shared education and outreach
- Possibly a TPO, administered by industry, not Govt, for agreed-upon functions
- **Uniform** Hg content standards

NEMA opposes . . .

- Policies that raise the price of EE lamps or present obstacles to developing new technologies
- Non-transparent (i.e., invisible) fees
- Enforceable target recycling rates
- Systems that would disrupt or create a financial burden for recyclers

Product Area - Batteries

In a Nutshell . . .

- NEMA supports and funds collection of rechargeable batteries (NiCads, Li ion, etc.)
  - RBRC operates in US and CAN, hundreds of thousands of collection sites
- NEMA does not support collection and recycling of primary, single-use batteries (AA, AAA, C, D, 9v)
  - Science (i.e., LCA) does not support it
  - They are miniscule part of waste stream
  - No value in recovered constituents
- NEMA opposes recycling Hg-added coin and button cell batteries
  - Principal chemistry phasing out now; others by 2014 or so
  - Far too many complications; inconsequential source of mercury
Summary

- In general, Product Stewardship is a sensible approach.
- Manufacturers play a key role in meeting the goals of product stewardship. 
  **NEMA supports...**
- Shared Responsibility - not only fair but efficient.
- Approaches that are economically viable and can be expected to have benefits.
- Performance measures that reflect real data and relate to actions and parties mfrs *can control*.

CONTACT INFORMATION

- Mark A. Kohorst
- 703-841-3249
- Mar_kohorst@nema.org
- NEMA
  - Suite 1752
  - 1300 North 17th Street
  - Rosslyn, Va. 22209